



**Legislative Assembly  
Province of Alberta**

No. 4

## **VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

First Session

Thirtieth Legislature

---

Tuesday, May 28, 2019

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair at 10:00 a.m.

### **Government Bills and Orders**

#### **Second Reading**

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 1 An Act to Repeal the Carbon Tax (\$) — Hon. Mr. Kenney

A debate followed.

Ms Sweet, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, moved that the motion be amended by deleting all of the words after “that” and substituting the following:

Bill 1, An Act to Repeal the Carbon Tax, be not now read a Second time but that the subject matter of the Bill be referred to the Standing Committee on Alberta’s Economic Future in accordance with Standing Order 74.2.

A debate followed on the amendment.

Debate adjourned on the amendment, Ms Pancholi speaking.

### **Adjournment**

Pursuant to Standing Order 4(2.1), the Assembly adjourned at 12:00 p.m. until 1:30 p.m.

## **ROUTINE**

### **Members' Statements**

MLA Allard, Hon. Member for Grande Prairie, made a statement congratulating the Grande Prairie 2019 graduating classes and regarding the Grande Prairie Stompede.

Ms Pancholi, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Whitemud, made a statement regarding affordable child care.

Mr. Nixon, Hon. Member for Calgary-Klein, made a statement regarding fulfilling promises he made to his constituents.

Ms Sigurdson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, made a statement regarding affordable housing.

Ms Goodridge, Hon. Member for Fort McMurray-Lac La Biche, made a statement regarding the generosity shown to those affected by the wildfires in northern Alberta.

Mr. Dach, Hon. Member for Edmonton-McClung, made a statement regarding farm workers' rights.

### **Introduction of Bills (First Reading)**

Notice having been given:

Bill 3 Job Creation Tax Cut (Alberta Corporate Tax Amendment) Act — Hon. Mr. Toews

### **Tabling Returns and Reports**

Mr. Orr, Hon. Member for Lacombe-Ponoka:

Recent email messages between Kathie Chessor and Driver Examination Standards, and letter dated May 21, 2019, from Laurie Smith of Blackfalds to Mr. Orr, Hon. Member for Lacombe-Ponoka, all concerning the lack of driver examination appointments available in Lacombe and Red Deer

Sessional Paper 15/2019

Recent email messages from Colleen Shippelt, Manager, Lacombe Registries, to Jeff Fry, Driver Programs Investigator, Alberta Transportation, expressing concern regarding an uncertified driver examiner conducting advanced tests

Sessional Paper 16/2019

Ms Renaud, Hon. Member for St. Albert:

Vox website article dated October 31, 2018, entitled “Why conservatives keep gaslighting the nation about climate change,” relating to comments made by Ms Renaud in the Assembly on May 27, 2019

Sessional Paper 17/2019

The Guardian website article, undated, entitled “We have 12 years to limit climate change catastrophe, warns UN,” relating to comments made by Ms Renaud in the Assembly on May 27, 2019

Sessional Paper 18/2019

National Geographic website article dated May 6, 2019, entitled “One million species at risk of extinction, UN report warns,” relating to comments made by Ms Renaud in the Assembly on May 27, 2019

Sessional Paper 19/2019

Mr. Carson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-West Henday:

CBC News website article dated June 15, 2015, entitled “Alberta couple blindsided after adopted girls turn out to have fetal alcohol disorder,” relating to comments made by Mr. Carson during debate on Motion Other Than a Government Motion 501 on May 27, 2019

Sessional Paper 20/2019

Hon. Mr. Nixon, Government House Leader:

Inheritance of Shame website article dated September 29, 2017, entitled “Inheritance of Shame: A Memoir, From Alberta’s Minister of Health,” relating to comments made by Hon. Mr. Nixon during a point of order on May 27, 2019

Sessional Paper 21/2019

Hon. Mr. Cooper, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly:

Letter dated May 21, 2019, from Glen Resler, Chief Electoral Officer, to Hon. Mr. Wanner, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly, and Mr. Merwan Saher, Clerk of the Assembly, confirming the results of the judicial recount for the electoral division of Calgary-Falconridge

Sessional Paper 22/2019

## **Tablings to the Clerk**

Clerk of the Assembly on behalf of Hon. Mr. Wilson, Minister of Indigenous Relations, pursuant to the Metis Settlements Act, cM-14, s211(2):

Metis Settlements Appeal Tribunal, Annual Report 2018

Sessional Paper 23/2019

Clerk of the Assembly on behalf of Hon. Mr. Shandro, Minister of Health:

Hospital Privileges Appeal Board, 2017 Annual Report	Sessional Paper 24/2019
Hospital Privileges Appeal Board, 2018 Annual Report	Sessional Paper 25/2019
Pursuant to the Public Health Act, cP-37, s7(2), Public Health Appeal Board, 2018 Annual Report	Sessional Paper 26/2019
Pursuant to the Health Professions Act, cP-37, s7(2):	
Alberta College of Medical Diagnostic and Therapeutic Technologists, 2018 Annual Report	Sessional Paper 27/2019
Alberta College of Paramedics, 2018 Annual Report	Sessional Paper 28/2019
Alberta College of Social Workers, Annual Report 2018	Sessional Paper 29/2019
Alberta College of Speech-Language Pathologists and Audiologists, Annual Report 2018	Sessional Paper 30/2019
College of Alberta Denturists, 2017 Annual Report	Sessional Paper 31/2019
College of Naturopathic Doctors of Alberta, Annual Report 2018	Sessional Paper 32/2019

## **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

### **Government Bills and Orders**

#### **Second Reading**

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 1 An Act to Repeal the Carbon Tax (\$) — Hon. Mr. Kenney

Debate continued on the amendment introduced by Ms Sweet, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, on May 28, 2019, that the motion be amended by deleting all the words after “that” and substituting the following:

Bill 1, An Act to Repeal the Carbon Tax, be not now read a Second time but that the subject matter of the Bill be referred to the Standing Committee on Alberta’s Economic Future in accordance with Standing Order 74.2.

Debate adjourned.

## **Adjournment**

The Assembly adjourned at 6:00 p.m. until 7:30 p.m.

TUESDAY, MAY 28, 2019 — 7:30 P.M.

## **Government Bills and Orders**

### **Second Reading**

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 2 An Act to Make Alberta Open for Business — Hon. Mr. Copping

A debate followed.

Ms Sweet moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

## **Government Motions**

11. Moved by Hon. Mr. Nixon:

A. Be it resolved that the Standing Orders of the Legislative Assembly of Alberta effective December 4, 2018, be amended as follows:

1. Standing Order 3 is amended

(a) in suborder (1) by striking out “Subject to suborder (1.1)” and substituting “Subject to suborder (1.1) and (1.2),”;

(b) by adding the following after suborder (1.1):

(1.2) The Assembly shall not meet in the morning from 10 a.m. to noon on Tuesday, or 9:00 a.m. to noon on Wednesday or Thursday, if the Government House Leader, or a member of the Executive Council acting on the Government House Leader’s behalf, notifies the Assembly that there shall be no morning sitting, notice having been given no later than the time of adjournment on the sitting day preceding the day on which the morning sitting will be cancelled.

- (c) by adding the following after suborder (5):
    - (5.1) In the period prior to, or following the commencement of, the first session of a Legislature, the Government House Leader may file a revised calendar with the Clerk, notwithstanding the deadline in suborder (5), following consultation with the Opposition House Leaders.
  - (d) in suborder (6) by adding “or (5.1)” after “unless varied by the calendar provided for under suborder (5)”;
  - (e) by striking out suborder (7) and substituting the following:
    - (7) As soon as possible after January 15 each year, and following receipt of a calendar submitted under suborder (5.1), the Clerk shall publish the calendar provided for under suborder (5) or (5.1).
2. Standing Order 7 is amended
- (a) in suborder (1) by striking out “Introduction of Guests” and substituting “Introduction of School Groups”;
  - (b) by striking out suborder (3) and substituting the following:
    - (3) When Introduction of School Groups is called, brief introductions may be made by the Speaker of groups of schoolchildren in the galleries.
  - (c) by adding the following after suborder (5):
    - (5.1) If any Member other than the mover rises to speak to a debatable motion to concur in a report of a committee on a Bill under Presenting Reports by Standing and Special Committees, debate on that motion shall be called under Orders of the Day
      - (a) when the Government thinks fit, in the case of a report on a Government Bill,
      - (b) on the next sitting day other than a Monday, in the case of a report on a private Bill, or
      - (c) on Monday afternoon under Motions for Concurrence in Committee Reports on Public Bills other than Government Bills, in the case of a report on a public Bill other than a Government Bill.

3. Standing Order 8 is amended
  - (a) by striking out suborder (1) and substituting the following:
    - 8(1) On Monday afternoon, after the daily routine, the order of business for consideration of the Assembly shall be as follows:

Motions for Concurrence in Committee Reports on Public Bills Other than Government Bills  
Written Questions  
Motions for Return  
Public Bills and Orders other than Government Bills and Orders  
At 5 p.m.: Motions other than Government Motions
    - (1.1) Notwithstanding suborder (1), if on a Monday afternoon prior to 5 p.m. no items of business other than Motions other than Government Motions remain on the Order Paper for consideration by the Assembly, Motions other than Government Motions shall be called and after the Assembly has decided all questions necessary to conclude debate on the motion, the Assembly shall proceed to consideration of any items of Government business provided for in suborder (2) unless unanimous consent is given to proceed to an additional Motion other than a Government Motion.
  - (b) by adding the following after suborder (7)(a):
    - (a.1) Debate on a motion to concur in a report of a committee on a public Bill other than a Government Bill will conclude after 55 minutes of debate on the motion and 5 minutes for the mover to close debate, unless the motion is voted on sooner.
4. Standing Order 13 is amended by adding the following after suborder (5):
  - (5.1) No Member shall disrupt the orderly conduct of the proceedings of the Assembly by loudly or repeatedly banging on a desk.
5. Standing Order 19(1) is amended
  - (a) in clause (a) and (b) by striking out “at 5:15 p.m., the Speaker shall interrupt the proceedings” and substituting “the Speaker shall interrupt the proceedings 15 minutes prior to the time of adjournment for the afternoon sitting”, and

- (b) in clause (c) by striking out “at 5:15 p.m., unless the debate is previously concluded, the Speaker shall put every question necessary to dispose of the motion” and substituting “unless the debate is previously concluded, the Speaker shall interrupt the proceedings 15 minutes prior to the time of adjournment for the afternoon sitting and immediately put every question necessary to dispose of the motion”.
6. Standing Order 29(3) is amended by striking out “and motions for returns” and substituting “, motions for returns and motions for concurrence in committee reports on public Bills other than Government Bills”.
7. The following is added after Standing Order 31:
- Confidence of the Assembly in the Government**
- 31.1 The confidence of the Assembly in the Government may be raised by means of a vote on
- (a) a motion explicitly worded to declare that the Assembly has, or has not, confidence in the Government,
  - (b) a motion by the President of Treasury Board and Minister of Finance, “That the Assembly approve in general the business plans and fiscal policies of the Government”,
  - (c) a motion for the passage of an Appropriation Bill as defined in Standing Order 64,
  - (d) a motion for an address in reply to the Lieutenant Governor’s speech, or
  - (e) any other motion that the Government has expressly declared a question of confidence.
8. Standing Order 32 is struck out and the following is substituted:
- Division**
- 32(1) A division may be called for by 3 Members rising.
- (2) When a division is called, the division bells shall be sounded at the beginning and for the last minute of a 15-minute interval.
- (3) After the first division is called during any meeting of the Committee of the Whole or Committee of Supply, the interval between division bells on all subsequent divisions during that meeting shall be reduced to one minute, except in the case of the first division called during an evening sitting that commences in Committee of the Whole or Committee of Supply pursuant to Standing Order 4(4).



(4) When Members have been called in for a division, there shall be no further debate.

(5) Members are not compelled to vote and those who wish to abstain should remain in their seats when asked to rise and record their vote.

(6) The Clerk shall record the ayes and the noes and announce to the Speaker the number of votes cast for and against the motion.

(7) The ayes and noes shall be entered in the Votes and Proceedings.

(8) Abstentions shall not be entered in the Votes and Proceedings.

9. Standing Order 37 is amended

(a) by striking out suborders (1) and (2) and substituting the following:

(1) Five copies, and any additional copies required by suborder (2), must be tabled of a document presented by a Member to the Assembly for

(a) placement of one copy in the records of the Assembly, and

(b) distribution of

(i) 2 copies to the Legislature Library,

(ii) one copy to *Hansard*,

(iii) one copy to the Government, in the case of a document tabled by the Speaker, the Official Opposition, any other party or group in opposition or an independent Member, and

(iv) one copy to the Official Opposition, in the case of a document tabled by the Speaker, a Member of the Government caucus, any other party or group in opposition or an independent Member.

(2) In addition to the copies required under suborder (1), one additional copy must be tabled of

(a) responses to written questions and returns ordered by the Assembly for distribution to the Member who asked the question or moved the motion for return, and

(b) any document presented by a Member who is neither a Member of the Government caucus nor the Official Opposition, to allow for distribution to both the Government and the Official Opposition under suborder (1).

(b) by striking out suborder (3).

10. The following is added after Standing Order 46:

**Debate interrupted by adjournment of the Assembly**

46.1 When a motion to adjourn the Assembly is carried or the Assembly is adjourned for want of quorum, the matter under consideration prior to the adjournment shall be deemed to be adjourned to a future sitting day.

11. Standing Order 52(1)(c) is struck out and the following is substituted:

(c) Private Bills and Private Members' Public Bills, consisting of 11 Members,

12. Standing Order 52.01(1) is amended by striking out clauses (a), (b) and (c) and substituting the following:

(a) Standing Committee on Families and Communities – mandate related to the areas of Children's Services, Community and Social Services, Education, Health, Justice and Solicitor General, Seniors and Housing and Service Alberta;

(b) Standing Committee on Alberta's Economic Future – mandate related to the areas of Advanced Education, Culture, Multiculturalism and Status of Women, Economic Development, Trade and Tourism, Labour and Immigration and Infrastructure;

(c) Standing Committee on Resource Stewardship – mandate related to the areas of Agriculture and Forestry, Energy, Environment and Parks, Indigenous Relations, Municipal Affairs, Transportation and Treasury Board and Finance.

13. The following is added after Standing Order 52.01:

**Subcommittees**

52.011(1) Unless otherwise ordered, a standing or special committee shall have the power to appoint one or more subcommittees, which shall report from time to time to the committee.

(2) Every subcommittee shall be appointed by motion of the committee specifying the terms of reference and the membership of the subcommittee.

- (3) At its first meeting of a new Legislature, every Legislative Policy Committee and the Standing Committee on Public Accounts shall appoint a Subcommittee on Committee Business to meet from time to time at the call of the Chair and to report to the committee on the business of the committee.
14. Standing Order 52.04 is amended by renumbering Standing Order 52.04 as Standing Order 52.04(1) and by adding the following after suborder (1):
- (2) Subject to Standing Order 59.01(11), suborder (1) does not prevent a Legislative Policy Committee from undertaking a hearing or inquiry during the same period of time that a matter stands referred to the committee by the Assembly if the hearing or inquiry does not interfere with the work of the committee on the matter referred to it.
15. Standing Order 59.01 is amended by adding the following after suborder (11):
- (12) Suborder (11) does not apply to the Standing Committee on Private Bills and Private Members' Public Bills.
16. Standing Order 59.02(3) is struck out and the following is substituted:
- (3) During consideration of interim, supplementary or main estimates, the following individuals may be seated at a committee or in the Assembly:
- (a) officials of the Government, to assist the Minister whose estimates are under consideration;
- (b) staff of the opposition, to assist Members who are participating in estimates consideration.
- (4) During main estimates consideration, officials of the Government may respond to questions from a committee at the request of the Minister.
17. Standing Order 64(1)(a) is amended by striking out subclause (ii).
18. Standing Order 74.1 is amended
- (a) by striking out the heading and substituting "Referral of Government Bill to a committee after first reading", and
- (b) by striking out suborder (1)(b).

19. The following is added after Standing Order 74.1:

**Referral of public Bill other than Government Bill after first reading**

74.11(1) After a public Bill other than a Government Bill has been read a first time, the Bill stands referred to the Private Bills and Private Members' Public Bills Committee.

(2) The Private Bills and Private Members' Public Bills Committee shall report back to the Assembly within 8 sitting days of the day on which the Bill was referred to the Committee.

20. Standing Order 74.2(2) is struck out and the following is substituted:

(2) Upon the concurrence of a committee report that a Bill be proceeded with, the Bill shall be placed on the Order Paper for second reading and, in the case of a public Bill other than a Government Bill, the Bill shall, subject to the precedence assigned to Bills standing on the Order Paper, be taken up on the next available Monday following the day on which the Assembly concurred in the report.

21. Standing Order 89 is amended by striking out "Standing Order 3" and substituting "Standing Order 3(5)".

22. The following Standing Orders are amended by striking out "Private Bills Committee" and substituting "Private Bills and Private Members' Public Bills Committee" wherever it occurs:

Standing Order 91(4)  
Standing Order 96(2)  
Standing Order 98(1) and (3)  
Standing Order 100(1)  
Standing Order 101  
Standing Order 102  
Standing Order 103  
Standing Order 104  
Standing Order 105(1)  
Standing Order 106

23. The headings preceding Standing Orders 98, 100 and 105 are amended by striking out "Private Bills Committee" and substituting "Private Bills and Private Members' Public Bills Committee".

- B. And be it further resolved that upon passage of this motion any public Bills other than Government Bills that stand on the Order Paper for second reading are deemed referred to the Standing Committee on Private Bills and Private Members' Public Bills in accordance with Standing Order 74.11(1) and notwithstanding Standing Order 74.11(2) the Committee shall report back to the Assembly on these Bills within 12 sitting days of the day this motion is passed."
- C. And be it further resolved that the amendments in this motion shall come into force on passage.

A debate followed.

Ms Sweet, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, requested and received the unanimous consent of the Assembly to shorten the interval between division bells to one minute for the duration of debate on Government Motion 11 for the remainder of the evening.

Ms Sweet, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, requested that the vote on Government Motion 11 be divided. Hon. Mr. Nixon, Government House Leader, responded to the request.

The Speaker ruled that Government Motion 11 will be debated as one motion and will be divided into two separate groups, as follows, for the purposes of voting:

Group 1: Part A, sections 2, 4, 8, 10

Group 2: Part A, sections 1, 3, 5, 6, 7, 9, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23; Part B; and Part C

Ms Hoffman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, moved that Government Motion 11 be amended as follows:

- A. Part A is amended by striking out "that the Standing Orders of the Legislative Assembly of Alberta effective December 4, 2018, be amended as follows:" and substituting "that the following proposed amendments to the Standing Orders of the Legislative Assembly of Alberta be referred to the Standing Committee on Privileges and Elections, Standing Orders and Printing for review and that the Committee submit its report to the Assembly on or before December 1, 2019
- B. Parts B and C are struck out.

A debate followed on the amendment.

The question being put, the amendment was defeated. With Mrs. Pitt in the Chair, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the amendment: 11

Ceci	Feehan	Pancholi
Dach	Goehring	Shepherd
Deol	Hoffman	Sweet
Eggen	Loyola	

Against the amendment: 31

Barnes	McIver	Schulz
Dreeshen	Neudorf	Schweitzer
Ellis	Nixon (Rimbey-Rocky Mtn. House-Sundre)	Sigurdson (Highwood)
Glasgo	Orr	Singh
Hanson	Rehn	Smith
Horner	Rosin	Stephan
Hunter	Rowswell	Turton
Long	Rutherford	Walker
Lovely	Sawhney	Williams
Luan	Schow	Wilson
Madu		

Debate continued on the main motion.

Mr. Shepherd, Hon. Member for Edmonton-City Centre, moved that Government Motion 11 be amended in Part A, in section 8, by striking out the proposed Standing Order 32(5) and (8).

A debate followed on the amendment.

Ms Sweet moved adjournment of the debate on the amendment, which was agreed to.

## **Government Bills and Orders**

### **Second Reading**

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 1 An Act to Repeal the Carbon Tax (\$) — Hon. Mr. Kenney

Debate continued on the amendment introduced by Ms Sweet, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, on May 28, 2019, that the motion be amended by deleting all the words after “that” and substituting the following:

Bill 1, An Act to Repeal the Carbon Tax, be not now read a Second time but that the subject matter of the Bill be referred to the Standing Committee on Alberta’s Economic Future in accordance with Standing Order 74.2.

The question being put, the amendment was defeated.

The following Bill was read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 1 An Act to Repeal the Carbon Tax (\$) — Hon. Mr. Kenney

### **Adjournment**

On motion by Hon. Mr. Nixon, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 10:52 p.m. until Wednesday, May 29, 2019, at 9:00 a.m.

---

Hon. Nathan M. Cooper,  
Speaker

Title: Tuesday, May 28, 2019